INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGIES IN PUBLIC CHILD WELFARE: A SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW

Stephanie K. Schneider
California State University - San Bernardino, Skschnedier@outlook.com

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.lib.csusb.edu/etd

Part of the Other Public Affairs, Public Policy and Public Administration Commons, and the Social Work Commons

Recommended Citation
Schneider, Stephanie K., "INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGIES IN PUBLIC CHILD WELFARE: A SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW" (2017). Electronic Theses, Projects, and Dissertations. 473.
https://scholarworks.lib.csusb.edu/etd/473

This Project is brought to you for free and open access by the Office of Graduate Studies at CSUSB ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Electronic Theses, Projects, and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of CSUSB ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact scholarworks@csusb.edu.
INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGIES IN PUBLIC CHILD WELFARE: A SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW

A Project
Presented to the
Faculty of
California State University,
San Bernardino

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Social Work

by
Stephanie Kiyako Yoshikawa Schneider
June 2017
INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGIES IN PUBLIC CHILD WELFARE: A SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW

A Project
Presented to the
Faculty of
California State University,
San Bernardino

by
Stephanie Kiyako Yoshikawa Schneider
June 2017

Approved by:

Dr. Carolyn McAllister, Faculty Supervisor, Social Work

Dr. Janet Chang, M.S.W. Research Coordinator
ABSTRACT

This systematic literature review synthesizes findings from empirical studies published between 1989 and 2016 to examine types, use, purpose and implementation of information and communication technology in public child welfare to determine if there are thematic reoccurrences in these arenas. Study results yielded information to the field of social work and public child welfare by determining themes in successful usage, purpose and implementation of information and communication technology in public child welfare to better serve those vulnerable populations. This systematic literature review contextualizes and identifies these themes across the literature. Studies included in this review were analyzed and categorized to determine reoccurring themes in information and communication technology use, purpose and implementation.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ................................................................................................................................. iii

LIST OF TABLES ........................................................................................................................... vi

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 1
Problem Statement ..................................................................................................................... 1
Purpose of the Study .................................................................................................................. 2
Significance of the Study for Social Work .............................................................................. 3

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 4
Child Welfare and the Adoption of Technology ...................................................................... 4

  Successful Use, Purpose and Implementation of Information and Communication Technology ................................................................................................................................. 6

  Ineffective Information Communication Technology Uses, Purposes and Implementation ................................................................................................................................. 8

Theories Guiding Conceptualization ......................................................................................... 11
Summary .................................................................................................................................. 12

CHAPTER THREE: METHODS

Introduction ................................................................................................................................. 14
Study Design .............................................................................................................................. 14
Data Sources ............................................................................................................................. 14
Data Analysis and Extraction ................................................................................................. 16
Data Synthesis .......................................................................................................................... 17
Limitations and Bias ................................................................................................................ 17
Summary .................................................................................................................................. 17

CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS
# Table of Contents

Introduction .............................................................................................................. 19

Presentation of the Findings .................................................................................... 19

Methodology of Included Studies ............................................................................ 19

Samples of Included Studies .................................................................................. 20

Information and Communication Technology Discussed ................................. 22

Purpose of the Information and Communication Technology .......................... 25

Use of Information and Communication Technology ........................................... 28

Implementation Plan ............................................................................................... 32

United States vs. Foreign ....................................................................................... 34

Success versus. Failure ........................................................................................... 35

Summary ................................................................................................................... 38

CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION

Introduction .............................................................................................................. 39

Discussion ............................................................................................................... 39

Purpose ..................................................................................................................... 39

Use of Information and Communication Technology ........................................... 40

Implementation of Information and Communication Technology .................... 41

Limitations ............................................................................................................... 42

Recommendations ................................................................................................. 42

Conclusion ............................................................................................................... 43

APPENDIX A: Table of Included Studies ............................................................... 44

Table of included Studies ..................................................................................... 44

REFERENCES .......................................................................................................... 104
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Methodology of Included Studies .............................................................. 19
Table 2. Samples of Included Studies .................................................................... 20
Table 3. Type of Information and Communication Technology Discussed .......... 22
Table 4. Purpose of Information and Communication Technology ...................... 25
Table 5. Use of Information and Communication Technology .............................. 29
Table 6. Implementation Plan .................................................................................. 32
Table 7. United States versus. Foreign ................................................................. 34
Table 8. Success versus. Failure ............................................................................ 35
CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

Introduction

The expanse of information and communication technology (ICT) has been introduced to public child welfare in various facets including but not limited to: SMS messaging, email, online training, web based applications, decision making tools, mobile phones, video conferencing, and comprehensive databases. ICT can have significant impact on service delivery, and the efficiency of social workers, ultimately impacting the families and communities they serve. Public child welfare faces high caseloads, crisis, and workforce shortages. ICT has the capacity to increase worker efficiency (Garrett, 2005). However, mistrust in use and purpose of ICT, and poor implementation processes can create huge public financial burdens, contradict worker efficiency and agency goals (Ince & Griffiths, 2011).

Problem Statement

Notably, a drastic shortfall in understanding and trust in ICT within social services is the conspicuous lack of empirical research about use, effectiveness and replicability (Chan & Holosko, 2016). Technology within social services indicates an increased efficiency and increased accessibility of services and resources (Garrett, 2005). However, public sector use of ICT is often lagging, with the lack of funding as a primary reason (Garrett, 2005). Identified concerns
with ICT include but are not limited to: ethics, confidentiality, security, financial liability, worker perceptions, feasibility, and ease of use (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008). As ICT continues to expand, further implementation into public child welfare is inevitable (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008).

This systematic literature review adds to existing research by aiming to determine, in the context of public child welfare identification of: 1) thematic uses of ICT, 2) thematic purposes for ICT, 3) successful methods of ICT implementation and 4) problematic ICT implementation.

Purpose of the Study

Public child welfare utilizes technology for a multitude of reasons including but not limited to: legislative mandates, monitoring and tracking of outcomes and worker efficiency, as well as improving service delivery (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008). Extensive research has been completed on ICT in public child welfare (Barker, Warburton, Hodgkins, & Pascal, 2014; Duncan, Hye-Chung, Weigensberg, Flair, & Stewart, 2008). As these agencies are often funded through taxpayer dollars, effective ICT use and implementation can save taxpayer monies by reducing failed, or ineffective ICT. Line workers, who investigate cases of possible child abuse, and workers who carry cases in which the agency is involved with stand to benefit greatly from ICT that has meaningful use, purpose and successful implementation. ICT has the potential to create drastic system and worker efficiency through: reducing worker time spent on documentation, paperwork, and other bureaucratic processes. This enables
workers to increase time spent on stabilizing and strengthening families, increasing services to families with children, thorough and timely investigations, meeting state and federal mandates, increasing time with families to reunify and close cases efficiently and safely, reducing harm and danger to children, and improving outcomes for foster children. Examining reoccurring motifs regarding purpose, use, and successful or failed implementation of ICT in public child welfare to provide insight to increase worker efficiency, improve fiscal responsibility, and to better serve the vulnerable and high risk populations of the world.

Significance of the Study for Social Work

Public child welfare and social work in general have been slow to adapt to the use of technology (Smith & Eaton, 2014). Considerable sums of taxpayer monies are invested to incorporate ICT into these agencies. However, lack of trust by line workers, ineffective technology systems, inept incorporation strategies lead to squandered resources, and ultimately harm to the children and families the agencies were designed to serve. This systematic literature review endeavors to identify thematic reoccurrences regarding ICT in child welfare to shed light on successful uses and implementation strategies, and imprudent uses of technology and implementation strategies to further promote social change, social justice, and to meet the needs of at risk and vulnerable families with children.
CHAPTER TWO
LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

Social work has a historical reluctance to implement technology into its day to day practice (Barker, Warburton, Hodgkins, & Pascal, 2014). ICT continues to grow exponentially and further propagate into public sectors. ICT within child welfare can have positive benefits, if purpose, use and implementation are effective; such as increased worker efficiency, increased client access to workers, and responsible spending of public monies. Adverse effects of poor use, purpose and implementation of ICT can result in fiduciary irresponsibility, worker frustration and distrust, and wasted resources. The following review of the literature examines the existing research of ICT within public child welfare, such as adoption, successful use and implementation, and ineffective use and implementation.

Child Welfare and the Adoption of Technology

Previous research regarding technology and social services indicate that technology can be utilized to increase efficiency, increase accessibility of resources and services (Garrett, 2005). Research (Klaus & Hartshorne, 2015) indicates that technology itself poses new challenges in regards to its use, and maintaining privacy and security. Child welfare workers have been historically reluctant to adopt ICT into their professional practice (Smith & Eaton, 2014).
Often line workers attribute ICT as instruments of administration and management meant to control their practice (Garrett, 2005). Smith and Eaton (2014) conducted multiple surveys and interviews regarding child welfare workers attitudes regarding technology and concluded that further qualitative study needs to be done to truly understand the reluctance in acceptance of ICT and dissemination into practice; as the experiential narrative could provide more in depth and applicable understanding regarding the use and purpose of ICT which directly affects approval of ICT into practice. LaPoint-Cox (2014) postulates that individuals in the social service field are not adverse to the increased utilization and dissemination of ICT however would prefer to have a complete and thorough assessment and knowledge of the technologies before incorporating them into their scope of practice.

Social work’s reluctance in accepting ICT may cause practitioners to become out of touch with contemporary culture, causing a disconnect between practice and clients which further creates difficulty in engaging and may cause harm to clients who live in a world where this technology is not only accessible but a facet of their daily lives (Barker, Warburton, Hodgkins, & Pascal, 2014). Researchers (Quinn, Sage, & Tunseth, 2015) found that child welfare workers were willing to utilize ICT if they understood the technology, the purpose behind the use, and felt that ICT would be beneficial for the families that they worked with.
There are recognized limitations of ICT in effectively managing knowledge in human services organizations (Fitch, 2012). Massive public information gathering databases, such as California’s Child Welfare System/Case Management System (CMS) began to rise up around 1989 (Webster, Needell, & Wildfire, 2002). As the era of technology reigns, child welfare agencies must continue to move along the continuum. Personal workstations, computers, mobile technologies and mass databases are more common, partially due to the falling financial costs of technology. Pelkonen and Valvovirta (2015) found that public employees and administration are interested in the procurement of services via technology however current challenges, such as legislation, policy, legal mandates and cost often impede the process. ICT projects are often considered high risk for public organizations often due to increased financial liability (Jang, 2014). These challenges in the procurement and use of ICT can have significant impact on the field’s adoption of technologies.

Information and Communication Technology in Public Child Welfare

Successful Use, Purpose and Implementation of Information and Communication Technology

ICT has the capacity to enhance communication with service users, such as computer mediated communication (Davies & Morgan, 2005). ICT also provides potential to further worker-client relationships and encourage increased self-disclosure, and increased participation in services (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008). ICT allows service users autonomy and anonymity as communication
does not have to occur face to face, which can increase confidence (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008). Use of SMS messaging, email, and chat systems can encourage less confrontational conversation between workers and clients (Barker, Warburton, Hodgkins, & Pascal, 2014). ICT also has the capacity to expand client’s access to workers and information through the use SMS messaging, email, and mobile phones (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008).

ICT allows increased engagement of service users (Fairclough, 2003). Forms of ICT that encourage this include resource websites, such as Ireland’s Web Safety in Youth Work that provides youth work practitioners with information, examples and resources for Internet safety (National Youth Council of Ireland, 2017). Other examples include web and mobile based applications that link service users to resources near them using GPS technology (Barker, Warburton, Hodgkins, & Pascal, 2014).

Public child welfare is laden with the development of systems to capture large amounts of data to identify trends in maltreatment, efficiency and outcomes (Nguyen, 2007). These mass databases also allow for integrated documentation and access to case information quickly (Peckover, Hall, & White, 2009). Technology reduces drains on resources for documentation and reconciling caseloads (Nguyen, 2007). The United States has publicly accessible data through the Adoptions and Foster Care Reporting and Analysis System (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2015). Another large data processing system that has been developed is the Child Welfare Services/Case

Australia’s Looking After Children Electronic System was developed for data collection and aggregation, program evaluation and ongoing planning (Dixon, 2001). The United Kingdom utilizes electronic recording of data for staff to analyze their own work, and contribute to service wide performance goals regarding outcomes for children (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008). Public child welfare also has begun the incorporation of documentation, data retrieval, and data access via mobile technology such as mobile phones, tablets, laptops and incorporating comprehensive databases to be available on mobile devices (Bowen, 2014). The leap to providing line workers access to case information has become wide spread in the United States (Bowen, 2014).

Structured decision making tools that are used in public child welfare to use research based methodologies to provide child welfare workers a practical approach to assessing risk (Johnson, 2004). ICT has the ability to produce and distribute information en masse automatically and reliably (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008).

**Ineffective Information Communication Technology Uses, Purposes and Implementation**

Often human services organizations misunderstand that ICT in it of itself is insufficient to ensure effective service delivery (Jang, 2014). There are workers who feel contemporary technology has a narrow and limited use in the field (Parrot & Madoc-Jones, 2008). Child welfare workers often view technology as a
means of accountability and productivity which is difficult to show when working with other human beings. Many child welfare workers on the front line believe and view technology as a way for management and administration to keep tabs on them, to accuse them of not completing enough work in a timely fashion (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008).

Immense data bases that link individual children can make it difficult to see familial and social relationships while workers get lost in the database searching for information (Hall, Peckover, & White, 2010). The U.K’s Integrated Children’s System (ICS), a mass database designed to capture and streamline child welfare failed on many levels (Ince & Griffiths, 2011). The failure of ICS demonstrates the consequences of poor ICT purpose, use and implementation such as: lost time due to chasing errors in the system, delays to case work, increase in time for administrative duties versus time spent with families, lowered morale, lowered worker motivation, increased cost due to additional training, duplication of work, and poor practice (Ince & Griffiths, 2011).

Child welfare workers and administration also fear technology taking over practice and replacing human interactions with the families that they work with (LaPoint-Cox, 2014). Even centers that hold virtual visits are viewed with apprehension regarding possible lost human interaction (Quinn, Sage, & Tunseth, 2015). Child welfare workers and administration also fear that their practice is being shaped by elected officials pushing the use of current technologies, while those elected officials are being pushed by information and
communication technology companies (Garrett, 2005). Researchers (Peckover, Hall & White, 2009) found that offices with higher percentages of workers uncomfortable with technology were less likely to utilize available technology in their practice. Much of the technology that was currently used was rated to be user unfriendly which may have also led to workers not choosing to utilize technology at their means (Peckover, Hall, & White, 2009). Public sector use of ICT is often in response for legislative demand for change and managerial demand for accountability (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008). ICT is often used to advance managerial interests, improve productivity, cutting cost, automating decision making, monitoring staff, and to reduce fraud (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008). Ongoing development and use of ICT in public child welfare can also appear to be coalitions between ICT developers and administration in the creation of profitable software and firmware (Garrett, 2005).

In areas that are heavily researched, such as public child welfare, often the demand and interest for the use of ICT comes from a research interest, and is not integrated for the purposes of immediate practice (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008). ICT that is not developed with the purpose of assisting front line worker’s need for access to information to assist in decision making processes are not likely to be found valuable by line workers (Munro, 2005). Examples include comprehensive databases that are designed to capture large amounts of data in an attempt to understand and predict trends in child maltreatment, and outcomes as well as determine workforce accountability (Hall, Peckover, & White, 2010).
Workers who do not reap benefit from the use of ICT will fail to see the intent or purpose behind it. Further, comprehensive data processing systems to store and analyze data to improve public child welfare outcomes still requires a knowledgeable analyst to process and translate the information into an understandable form (Webster, Needell, & Wildfire, 2002).

Other risks that involve the use of ICT in public child welfare include increased vulnerability of children, loss of assessment capacity, diminished worker-client relationship and lack of reach to individuals who do not have access to ICT (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008).

Theories Guiding Conceptualization

In reviewing the literature regarding ICT there are several theoretical concepts that have guided studies that have been previously done. Theories regarding network society (Quinn, Sage, & Tunseth, 2015) and constructivist grounded theory (Pelkonen & Valovirta, 2015) were utilized in some studies. Other studies did not specifically state the theoretical framework that was utilized. For the purposes of this systematic literature review sociotechnical systems theory will be utilized. Sociotechnical systems theory denotes an approach to organizational work design, recognizing the interaction between human beings and technology as well as the interactions between societal systems and human behavior (De Greene, 1990). Sociotechnical systems theory appropriately frames the understanding of the use, purpose and implementation of ICT in public child welfare by integrating understanding of how technology interacts with
human beings and other complex societal infrastructure. An understanding, and synthesis of empirical work regarding ICT and public child welfare it is essential to understand that ICT as a system will interact uniquely with individuals and other systems.

Summary

This chapter reviewed literature regarding public child welfare and ICT. Contemporary studies regarding ICT use in the field of public child welfare indicates that line workers rate the current technology available as user unfriendly (Peckover, Hall, & White, 2009), and often view technology as a managerial method of control and tracking productivity (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008). However public child welfare has adopted ICT in the forms of data bases (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2015), data processing systems (California Child Welfare Indicator Project, 2015), mobile technology (Bowen, 2014), assessment tools (Johnson, 2004) and others. Public child welfare can view ICT projects as financially risky (Jang, 2014). Furthermore there are numerous identified concerns with ICT in public child welfare. These concerns for ICT in public child welfare include: ICT being designed primarily for research purposes instead of immediate line worker benefit (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008), or ineffective ICT which duplicates work, lowers morale, and has high financial expenditure (Ince & Griffiths, 2011), loss of worker client engagement and relationship (Hall, Peckover, & White, 2010). Possible gains for incorporation of ICT involve: ability to capture, store and analyze comprehensive
data (Naccarato, 2010), increased worker efficiency and access to case records (Barker, Warburton, Hodgkins, & Pascal, 2014), increased worker availability to clients (Bowen, 2014), and increase in worker client engagement (Tregeagle & Darcy, 2008). Currently there is no fundamental understanding across agencies as to how or why to use, or not use forms of ICT. Examination and identification of themes present in use, purpose and implementation practices of ICT in child welfare may enlighten key elements for success in these areas.
CHAPTER THREE

METHODS

Introduction
This chapter describes the design of the systematic literature review including the data sources, databases used, timeframe of the studies and search terms. This chapter discusses the inclusion and exclusion criteria for the literature included in this systematic review, and process for data extraction and analysis.

Study Design
The study design is a systematic literature review of published, peer-reviewed empirical research on the purpose, use and implementation of ICT in public child welfare. The study design aimed to identify thematic reoccurrences of purpose, use, and implementation of ICT in public child welfare. This systematic literature review searched databases for existing research regarding purpose, use and implementation of ICT in public child welfare with specific inclusion and exclusion criteria. Once the studies were selected through the inclusion criteria the data was processed for data extraction and analysis.

Data Sources
A comprehensive search of peer-reviewed and empirical studies was initiated utilizing searching scholarly journals such as: Child Abuse Review,
Research on Social Work Practice, Journal of Technology in Human Services, British Journal of Social Work, Child Maltreatment, Children and Youth Services Review, a search function such as Academic Search Premier, JSTOR, Social Care Online, and EBSCO host, as well as one search engine: Google Scholar using deviations of key search terms to locate data. Key terms that were used are as follows: technology, child welfare, social services, information and communication technology, ICT, implementation, purpose, use, child protection, CPS. The electronic search yielded the initial results. The abstracts of articles included in the initial search results were then reviewed to determine if the study met inclusion criteria. If the abstract met one or more of the inclusion criteria then the full article will be retrieved for full review.

Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

For the purposes of this systematic literature review only published, peer-reviewed, empirical studies were utilized. All studies included were in regards to one or more of following regarding purpose, use, and/or implementation of ICT in public child welfare: the study indicated that it is original research, the article is an empirical study in regards to policy or legislation, or reviews of empirical literature. Articles were from 1989 through 2016. 1989 marks the era of which massive governmental databases, such as California’s Child Welfare System/Case Management System began to be publicly launched (California Child Welfare Indicator Project, 2015). Studies were qualitative or quantitative. If
the article abstract did not meet one or more of the inclusion criteria due to a lack of information within the abstract the article was retrieved for full review.

Studies were excluded for the following reasons: the article contains a study that dates further back from 1989, or was published after the writing of this systematic literature review. Studies in regards to ICT and were not specific to public child welfare were excluded. To avoid duplication articles were also excluded if the report was based off of another study that was already included in this review. Studies were also excluded if after full review the study was found not to meet one or more of the inclusion criteria. Tables regarding the findings of the selected studies are included in this systematic literature review regarding methodology, types of ICT studied, sample bases of the studies, use, purpose, implementation of ICT, US or foreign studies, and success or failure of the ICT being studied.

Data Analysis and Extraction

Once the comprehensive search was conducted and studies were selected for inclusion the potential studies were entered into an Excel file for data analysis and extraction. The final selected studies were reviewed and classified into categories regarding methodology, type of ICT and if the study was in regards to purpose, use or implementation of ICT, US or foreign based, and if the ICT was a success or failure. These categories were reviewed to attempt to identify thematic occurrences regarding the use, purpose or implementation of ICT in public child welfare.
Data Synthesis

Due to the possible and probable significant differences in methodology a meta-analysis was not possible. Ergo the results were synthesized by categorizing findings to review for reoccurring motifs in purpose, use and implementation of ICT in public child welfare.

Limitations and Bias

This systematic literature review aims at providing a distinctive contribution to research however there were limitations in the study. One such limitation is that only empirical, peer-reviewed, published studies that were available in English were included in this systematic literature review. Unpublished documents, public child welfare agency reports, studies published in languages other than English and expert testimony were not included in this study. Future studies may consider including those data sources. Furthermore the exclusion of unpublished studies, studies published in languages other than English may present bias into the study. Another concern with the presentation of bias into the study is that the study was performed by one investigator as which bias may be present in the selection of studies to be included in this systematic literature review.

Summary

This chapter reviewed the design and process of the systematic literature review. A comprehensive search of data bases for identified key terms was
conducted. Key terms included: technology, child welfare, social services, information and communication technology, ICT, implementation, purpose, use, child protection, CPS. The abstracts of the initial search result were reviewed to determine inclusion or exclusion based off of the stated criteria. Articles in which the abstract met inclusion criteria were subsequently retrieved for full review. Articles in which the inclusion or exclusion criteria were unable be met due to insufficient information provided in the abstract were retrieved for full review to determine if they met inclusion criteria. Full review of the articles entailed full review and categorization of the following: citation, purpose of the study, methodology utilized, types, purpose, and implementation processes of ICT and if the study revealed any success, failure or no results. Due to the possible and probability of mixed methodology a meta-analysis is unable to be performed. The limitations of this systematic literature review are discussed as there is the possibility for bias due to the systematic literature review utilized only studies that are empirical, peer-reviewed and available in English. Further bias is possible due to the nature of the systematic literature review being completed by one investigator.
CHAPTER FOUR

RESULTS

Introduction

This chapter discusses the findings of this study. Findings of the study and tables are provided to assist in the description of the results of the study. Once the comprehensive search was completed utilizing scholarly journals, search functions and a search engine the results were analyzed in the following categories: methodology of the study, sample of the study, type of ICT discussed, purpose of the ICT, use of the ICT, implementation plan, if the ICT was determined to be a success or failure, and if the study was US based or international. After the search was completed, duplicates were excluded and any questionable studies were read in full to determine if they met inclusion criteria sixty one studies remained. Please see Appendix A for a full list of studies included.

Presentation of the Findings

Methodology of Included Studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Methodology of the Study</th>
<th>Number of Studies</th>
<th>Percent of Studies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Review of Literature</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed Method</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Of the sixty one studies that met inclusion criteria there were four methodologies present. The majority of the studies utilized a review of literature to base their research on. This literature included scholarly works, but also included government reports and other data to determine their findings. Mixed methodology included any study that utilized two more forms of research. These studies often used both a review of literature and qualitative data. Studies that used qualitative data performed interviews with their samples to gather data. Lastly studies that were identified using quantitative data utilized surveys, or outcomes measurement to gather research. The least popular methodology that was utilized was quantitative. There were far fewer studies looking at survey data, or numerical information to make determinations. Quantitative data gathered from a secondary analysis of the 2008 Survey of Organizational Excellence provided key findings that the large databases used failed to fulfill the intended purposes of ICT driven interventions, and instead fragmented knowledge (Jang, 2015).

Samples of Included Studies

Table 2. Samples of Included Studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample of the Study</th>
<th>Number of Studies</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sample not</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Of the studies that met inclusion criteria, a majority of the studies did not clarify the sample of the study. Of the studies that clarified their sample population the most frequent sample population that was used was child welfare staff; including individuals in line staff positions, supervisory positions and management positions. Less frequently used were client samples. Client population samples ranged from foster families, to child welfare dependent youth to families involved with public child welfare systems. Studies that utilized these samples frequently studied ICT where the client was the end user of the technology. Four studies utilized a combination of samples. An internet based referral service that was accessible to workers, clients and the public was researched (Dellor, Lovato-Herman, Wolf, Curry, & Freisthler, 2015). The technology in question was used by both child welfare staff to provide clients with referrals to service, and accessible by clients to initiate their own referrals both samples were studied (Dellor, Lovato-Herman, Wolf, Curry, & Freisthler, 2015). The least frequently utilized sample was exclusively studying available literature.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample Description</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Child Welfare staff, social workers, management and others</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Client Sample: including foster families, children or client families</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combination of the samples</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literature Only</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Information and Communication Technology Discussed

Table 3. Type of Information and Communication Technology Discussed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of ICT Discussed</th>
<th>Number of Studies</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Databases</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet Based Technology</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Based Technology</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision Support Technology</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobile Technology</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital Intervention</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Media</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Identified information and communication technology discussed within the studies that met inclusion criteria were databases, communication, internet based technology, and office based technology, decision support technology, mobile technology, social media, digital intervention and ‘other’. These categories were not mutually exclusive as studies discussed multiple forms of technology.

ICT in the form of databases were most often large administrative databases that functioned for document tracking, outcomes measurement and data collection. Often these large databases were criticized for adding to administrative workload (Holmes, McDermid, Jones, & Ward, 2009), and that the
information gathered was time consuming (White, Wastell, Broadhurst, & Hall, 2010), and there was a loss in the narrative story of the clientele (Wastell & White, 2014).

Communication was another form of technology that was studied, for the purposes of this research communication technology was limited to ICT which purpose was to improve communication via spoken word, written communication, or digital face to face communication. Audio Video Assisted visitation for parents to receive coaching during visitation had preliminary success (Nese, Anderson, & Fisher, 2016).

Internet based technology was described in seven studies. Internet based technology included ICT that based its use on an internet connection. Foster children who were able to utilize email or internet video chat to communicate with relatives, siblings or parents were more likely to maintain connections when placement disrupts (Sen, 2010). Many of the criticisms of internet based technology were lack of access to internet connection (Loree, Beliciu, & Ondersma, 2014; Sen, 2010).

Office based technology included telephones, fax machines, desktop computers, etc. These forms of technology were studied in regards to decrease administrative workload, and increase efficiency (Sage, 2014; Sen, 2010; Zonfrillo, Kumar, Fortes, & Winston, 2012). These office based technologies were often found to increase productivity, but had less of an impact on the narrative quality of social work (Sage, 2014). Although many of the other
systems of ICT, such as databases, mobile technology, social media, digital intervention and decision support technology utilize office based technology to function these categories assess a different function of technology. The category of office based technology specifically analyzes the physical technological equipment.

Decision support technology included systems and programs to assist child welfare workers to make decision regarding child welfare clients and juvenile dependency cases. These technologies were found to provide an overestimation of risk and significantly restricted practice (Gillingham & Humphreys, Child protection practioners and decision making tools: observations from the front line, 2010). Decision support technology is often legislatively or policy mandated (Gillingham & Humphreys, 2010; Munro, 2005; Wastell, White, Broadhurst, Peckover, & Pithouse, 2010). Decision support technology was often described as a method to standardize practice (Foster & Stiffman, 2010).

Mobile technology for the purpose of this systematic literature review refers to mobile devices including but not limited to: cellular phones, tablets, and laptops with access to internet, databases, decision support technology, and communication. Mobile technology for the purpose of increasing communication noted (Morgan & Fraser, 2010; Nese, Anderson, & Fisher, 2016).

Digital interventions referred to social work intervention in public child welfare. The studies that met inclusion criteria studied interventions that used

Social media refers to any social media platform, either mentioned in specificity and in general. Two studies referenced social media as the purpose of their study. The purposes of these studies were to examine social media use by social workers (Breyette & Hill, 2015; Sage & Sage, 2015).

In this systematic review the other category referred to any other form of ICT that did not fall into the above categories. Only one study fell into this category and involved geographic mapping technology to identify data on areas of higher concern for foster youth populations in instances of natural disaster (Webster, Needell, & Wildfire, Data are your friends: child welfare agency self-evaluation in Los Angeles County with the Family to Family iniative, 2002).

### Purpose of the Information and Communication Technology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purpose of ICT</th>
<th>Number of Studies</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Data mining, record keeping, administrative functions</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT to improve service delivery</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT to increase efficiency</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT to increase worker retention and reduction of worker stress</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Purpose of technology discussed in the included studies ranged from communication, efficiency, data mining, record keeping and administrative purposes, worker retention and reduction of stress, support, improve service delivery or not mentioned. For the purposes of this literature review these categories were not identified as mutually exclusive.

Forty three studies that met inclusion criteria identified the purpose of the technology discussed was data mining, record keeping and administrative functions. These purposes were often in conjunction with other purposes. Record keeping integration into other purposes were found to make the data difficult to gather (Dewitte, Declercq, & Hermans, 2015). It was also difficult to determine outcomes based purely on ICT used for administrative functions, record keeping and data mining (Kaonga, Baravia, Philbrisk, & Mechael, 2016).

Of the sixty one studies that met inclusion criteria forty two studies indicated that the purpose of the ICT mentioned was to improve service delivery. Improvement of service delivery for the purposes of this systematic literature review was only in regards to services directly provided by public child welfare staff to clients. Identifying ICT to improve outcomes for children involved in the public child welfare systems in the instance of a global emergency utilized a
variety of technology and samples to determine that to improve service delivery further investigation was needed (Kaonga, Baravia, Philbrisk, & Mechael, 2016).

Thirty eight studies indicated that the purpose of the ICT discussed was to increase worker efficiency. ICT use to increase worker efficiency came with practice concerns regarding confidentiality, change in professional expectations, accountability and development of the ICT to increase worker efficiency was not created in conjunction or with the end user in mind (Burton & van den Broek, 2009). ICT to increase efficiency were met with difficulty as staff often had embedded work patterns (Foster & Stiffman, 2010).

Eighteen studies that met inclusion criteria indicated that the purpose of the ICT being discussed was communication. The purpose of communication includes communication between different agencies which held a great deal of concern for ethics, privacy as well as a concern for state governments taking a parental role in the lives of children (Penna, 2005). ICT for the purpose of communication required ongoing administrative support and training for all professionals involved (Dodsworth, Bailey, Schofield, Cooper, Fleming, & Young, 2013).

Out of sixty one studies that met inclusion criteria eighteen studies identified that support as a purpose of the ICT discussed. For the purposes of this systematic literature review support technology was deemed to be supportive of workers and clients, although the category is not mutually exclusive of workers, clients or both. Internet based communication networking technology's
purpose was to provide support for substitute caregivers of children in the foster care system to increase and enhance communication between care providers and the assigned social worker (Dodsworth, Bailey, Schofield, Cooper, Fleming, & Young, 2013). Audio computer self-interviewing purpose was to support foster youth to determine wellbeing (Morgan & Fraser, 2010). When social media is utilized to support professional activism and, support to expand types and resources of information and networks available to child welfare workers (Sage & Sage, 2015).

Two studies indicated that the purpose of the ICT discussed was to increase worker retention and reduction of worker stress. Office based technology in terms of a ‘time tracker’ time sheet program was implemented to reduce the administrative workload of workers (Cahill & Feldman, 1993). Mobile technology and ICT to provide direct services were also found to serve a purpose of reducing worker stress and increasing worker implementation (Jabaley, Lutzker, Whitaker, & Self-Brown, 2011).

One study that met inclusion criteria did not indicate a purpose. This research indicated that ICT can assist in standardization and control of direct practice intervention (Chan & Holosko, 2016). As this study indicated that it was a systematic review of ICT enhancements to interventions there was no specific purpose to the ICT being reviewed (Chan & Holosko, 2016).

Use of Information and Communication Technology
Table 5. Use of Information and Communication Technology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ICT Use</th>
<th>Number of Studies</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gathering and Streaming Information</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No Specification of Use</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduction of Administrative Workload</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcomes Management</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Client Use</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobility of the Workforce</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The studies identified a specific use of the technology discussed. These variables were identified as: none mentioned, the gathering and streamlining of information and data, reduction of administrative workload, specific use by clients, specific mobility use, communication use, training, and outcomes management. These variables were not designated to be mutually exclusive of each other. Different studies identified different primary uses of the ICT even when the ICT was the same in each study.

Thirty two studies indicated that the primary use of the ICT indicated that gathering and streaming information. Most likely the form of gathering and streamlining information was in reference to large databases to store information, such as the Integrated Children’s System (Gillingham & Humphreys, 2010; Nygren, Hyvon, & Khoo, 2009). Large databases gathering, storing information
as a primary use of ICT provide a coherent and comprehensive system of electronic record keeping were most often used in large governmental agencies (Penna, 2005).

Seventeen studies did not identify a specific use of the ICT discussed. These studies did not specify use of ICT. A discussion of social media use by child welfare did not specify the use of technology, as this was a discussion about possible uses of social media, as well as discussion of ethical use of social media by public child welfare (Sage & Sage, 2015). A study into case manager strain did not specify the use of the technologies that quantitative data was gathered on (Preston, 2015).

Ten studies identified the use of ICT was to reduce administrative workload for social work staff. The standardized risks and safety assessment tools were cited as a form of ICT to reduce administrative workload by social work staff (Gillingham & Humphreys, 2010; Nygren, Hyvon, & Khoo, 2009). Standardized tools had an identified use of reduction of administrative workloads by creating consistency and standardization in the decision social work staff made regarding children (Gillingham & Humphreys, Child protection practioners and decision making tools: observations from the front line, 2010). Large data bases also identified their use was to reduce administrative workload of social work staff (Munro, 2005)

Eight studies identified outcomes management as the use of the ICT. Large scale government data bases were also cited as having a primary use of
outcomes management (Mitchell & Sloper, 2008; Penna, 2005). ICT with an identified purpose of outcomes management sought to create more efficient, coherent and uniform service to clientele by managing outcomes (Mitchell & Sloper, 2008).

Six studies indicated that the identified use of the ICT was for client use. An internet based forum with a purpose of communication and networking for foster parents had an identified use specifically of client use (Dodsworth, Bailey, Schofield, Cooper, Fleming, & Young, 2013). Another study identified client use was video feedback technology for parents to receive coaching during and after visitation with their children (Nese, Anderson, & Fisher, 2016).

Two studies indicated that the identified use of the ICT was for training purposes. This identified purpose was not limited to social worker training. The audio feedback technology that allows parents to receive coaching during and after visitation with their children acts as a training agent (Nese, Anderson, & Fisher, 2016). These feedback sessions act as training for parents on interaction with their children (Nese, Anderson, & Fisher, 2016). Another study investigated an internet blog utilized to assist facilitator training for Family Group Decision Making Meetings (Sage, 2014). This study utilized a blog forum to post training material and updated information on Family Group Decision Making Meetings as well as post questions and answers in a virtual question and answer forum (Sage, 2014).
One study indicated that the identified use of the ICT was to improve the mobility of the workforce. Public child welfare staff in Atlanta, GA utilized iPhones and SafeCare to reduce face to face home safety session (Jabaley, Lutzker, Whitaker, & Self-Brown, 2011). This technology allowed for further mobility of the workforce as well as safely reduce face to face home visits (Jabaley, Lutzker, Whitaker, & Self-Brown, 2011). The use of the mobile technology allowed workers to have handheld technology with video call capability to further mobilize the workforce (Jabaley, Lutzker, Whitaker, & Self-Brown, 2011).

Only one study indicated that one of the primary uses for the ICT was communication. Although communication can be inferred as a use from the other studies it was not indicated in the study itself that the purpose of the ICT was for communication.

**Implementation Plan**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ICT Implementation</th>
<th>Number of Studies</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Did not mention an implementation plan</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilization of a phases or stages plan</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change in Policy</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indiscriminate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pilot program</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus group initiation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice driven</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Of the studies that met inclusion criteria of this systemic literature review implementation plan was categorized in values of none mentioned, phases or stages, indiscriminate implementation plan, focus group oriented, a pilot program was initiated, focus group initiated, pilot program initiated, policy driven or practice driven. These values were mutually exclusive. Forty-five studies did not mention an implementation plan.

Four studies discussed using a phases or stages implementation plan. The implementation of a database and processing system for public child welfare agency for rural Native American agency indicated that the most valuable phase of the implantation was the design of the system coordinated between the designers and the end users (Scannapieco & Iannone, 2015). A study regarding Telehealth technology indicated that a stage of successful staff engagement is imperative when implementing ICT (Pammer, et al., 2001).

One study described an indiscriminate implementation plan. This study was in regards to office based technology (Cahill & Feldman, 1993). Although this study indicated that there was an implementation plan it was not described in the study. One study described a focus group initiated implementation plan. This study described an internet support group for grandparents raising grandchildren (Loree, Beliciu, & Ondersma, 2014). This study described a focus group to implement the internet support group by garnering focus group feedback
One study discussed a pilot program initiated implementation plan. This study described a self-evaluation program within public child welfare (Webster, Needell, & Wildfire, Data are your friends: child welfare agency self-evaluation in Los Angeles County with the Family to Family initiative, 2002). This pilot program was designed as a self-evaluation for public child welfare in Los Angeles County and begun implementation as a pilot program to overcome initial resistance (Webster, Needell, & Wildfire, Data are your friends: child welfare agency self-evaluation in Los Angeles County with the Family to Family initiative, 2002).

Two studies discussed the technology implementation was due to a change in policy. Although the implementation was described as a change in policy there was no clear indication of a detailed implantation plan it was clear that implementation of the ICT was based on policy or legislative change (Peckover & Hall, 2009; White, Wastell, Broadhurst, & Hall, 2010). One study discussed the implementation plan being practice driven. This study described that the technology was implemented into a locally adapted and standardized practice, and the guiding hand of implementation was already established practice and implemented with information primarily from the end user (Tregeagle, 2016).

United States versus. Foreign

Table 7. United States versus. Foreign
Of the sixty one studies that met inclusion criteria thirty eight studies were determined to have been international, or foreign of the United States in origin. Nineteen of the sixty one studies were based out of the United States and four of the sixty one studies were unable to be determined of a country of origin.

Success versus. Failure

Table 8. Success versus. Failure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Number of Studies</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Undetermined, unknown or not applicable</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Failure</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Success</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Determination of Success versus Failure.

Studies that met inclusion criteria were reviewed for success versus failure values. These values included if the technology discussed was determined to be implemented successfully, if implementation was a failure or is success or failure was undetermined, unknown or not applicable. If the technology discussed was determined to be a partial success it was included in the success values. These
values are determined to be mutually exclusive. Twenty four studies indicated
either that success or failure was undeterminable, unknown or the discussion of
success or failure was not applicable to the original study.

Twenty one studies indicated that the implementation of the technology
discussed was determined to be a failure. The Integrated Children’s System
(ICS) and Common Assessment Framework (CAF) were largely documented as
a failure (Holmes, McDermid, Jones, & Ward, 2009; Mitchell & Sloper, 2008;
Parton, 2005; Penna, 2005). The ICS and CAF were cited as a failure due to
concerns in privacy and the shift of responsibility away from parents onto the
government (Parton, 2005), technical problems and insufficient information for
implementation (Mitchell & Sloper, 2008), increase in time spent on indirect
database activities compared with direct service activities (Holmes, McDermid,
Jones, & Ward, 2009), and piecemeal implementation within the agencies
(Penna, 2005).

Sixteen studies were identified as the discussed ICT was implemented
successfully. An internet based referral service that was accessible to both
social workers and clients in Los Angeles County was determined to be
successful (Dellor, Lovato-Herman, Wolf, Curry, & Freisthler, 2015). The ICT
was determined to be successful when users were active participants in the
implementation and refinement of the ICT (Dellor, Lovato-Herman, Wolf, Curry, &
Freisthler, 2015). There were some marked concerns, such as when users did
not have internet access or computer access, however the overall determination
was that when used the program was considered a success (Dellor, Lovato-Herman, Wolf, Curry, & Freisthler, 2015). A digital intervention program to provide online social support for foster families was determined to be successful (Finn & Kerman, 2004). This online social support group was deemed a success based off of qualitative interviews with the end user, the foster families.

There were insufficient repetitions in types of technology within the studies that considered the implementation of the technology to be a success to determine if there was any significance. The studies that considered implementation a success types of technology studied included: a time tracking program (Cahill & Feldman, 1993), an internet based referral program (Dellor, Lovato-Herman, Wolf, Curry, & Freisthler, 2015), online support group for foster families (Finn & Kerman, 2004), use of administrative databases for data mining of longitudinal data (Kum, Stewart, Rose, & Duncan, 2015), external service system evaluation for decision support tools and large data bases (Lonne, Brown, Warner, & Gillespie, 2014), kinship support group (Loree, Beliciu, & Ondersma, 2014), organizational and office technologies (Preston, 2015), training blog and forum for child welfare staff (Sage, 2014), creation of case record and documentation system for a child protection agency (Scannapieco & Iannone, 2015), development of ICT by a nongovernmental child welfare agency (Tregeagle, 2016), web-based telecenter for child fatality reviews (Zonfrillo, Kumar, Fortes, & Winston, 2012), computer assisted self-interviewing of foster
youth (Morgan & Fraser, 2010), and geographical desktop mapping of concern for foster youth (Webster, Needell, & Wildfire, 2002).

Summary

The preceding chapter reviewed the results of the study. Of the studies that met inclusion criteria thirty seven percent of the studies were a review of literature, forty nine percent of the studies did not clarify the sample used, sixty two percent of the studies indicated that the ICT being studied were databases, seventy percent of the studies indicated a purpose of data mining and record keeping, fifty two percent indicated a use of gathering and streamlining information, seventy four percent of studies indicated no mention of an implementation plan, sixty two percent of the studies were foreign based and thirty nine percent of the studies were undetermined if the technology implemented was a success or failure. There was insufficient repetition of types of ICT and success to determine any type of relationship between these two variables.
CHAPTER FIVE
DISCUSSION

Introduction

This chapter discusses the implications of this systematic literature review. This systematic literature review indicates that the success of the use, purpose and implementation of ICT in public child welfare is dependent upon the value and ease of use for the end user. Public child welfare would benefit from further qualitative and quantitative research into the implementation of ICT with more input, feedback and collaboration with the end user.

Discussion

Purpose

Largely, majority of the studies that met inclusion criteria indicated data mining, record keeping and administrative functions. Purposes that correlated to data mining, record keeping and administrative functions indicated lower success rates with much of this contributing to line worker perceptions of management and administration utilizing ICT as a method of gathering punitive data via outcomes measurement and loss of professional discretion.

Forty nine percent of the studies included in this systematic literature review conveyed a stated purpose of the ICT being studies was to improve service delivery. ICT to improve service delivery often involved increased input from the end user, however many of these studies were unable to indicate
success or failure due to a requirement of longitudinal data not yet available, or no longer published in empirical data. ICT utilized for the purposes of improving service delivery may also track outcomes for families which is often perceived as negative or punitive.

Use of Information and Communication Technology

This systematic literature review indicated that gathering and streaming information were the highest percentage of noted use of ICT, with communication and mobility of the workforce were the least cited use of the ICT examined in the studies included. The gathering and streaming of information as a use for ICT in public child welfare tended to be in reference to large governmental databases to store electronic record keeping (Gillingham & Humphreys, 2010; Nygren, Hyvon, & Khoo, 2009). The trends in this information show a trend in managerialism and focus on outcomes within public child welfare. These forms of technology were linked to higher rates of failure, or undeterminable for success or failure.

Communication and mobility of the workforce were the least cited use of ICT with mobility of the workforce and communication comprising of only 2 percent of the studies in this systematic literature review each. ICT has the capacity to further enhance communication, which is a vital component of preserving the presence of the narrative in public child welfare. Many forms of ICT would increase availability and modes of communication, however the amount of studies involving ICT and communication are minimal.
Implementation of Information and Communication Technology

Of the studies in this systematic literature review, thirty-nine percent were unable to determine, or determined that success or failure of the implementation of ICT was not applicable. However, thirty-four percent of the studies included in this systematic literature review indicated that the implementation of the ICT being studied was determined to be a failure. Many of these studies researched large systemic forms of ICT that were implemented due to changes in legislation, policy or law with little documented contact with the end user. Implementation of ICT via legislative mandates with little input from the end user creates beliefs that ICT is being utilized as a tool of management and administration to control public child welfare practice (Garrett, 2005). When the end user does not find value in the ICT being implemented the degree of success is highly impacted (Munro, 2005).

Contrarily twenty-six percent of studies indicated the implementation of the ICT was successful. These studies indicated a variety of types of ICT, however a thematic reoccurrence of high levels of input from the end user were indicated via the implementation process. These forms of technology ranged from computer assisted self-interviewing, electronic communication, and even documentation and data storage systems. The common themes of the successful implementation of these varied technology was the significant input and participation of the end user. The end user in these scenarios varied from foster parents, social workers and clients themselves. This indicates that the type of
technology, purpose, use and end user of the technology is not as important as incorporating the feedback and input of the end user.

There was not significant overlap between types of ICT used, their purpose, and implementation to accurately denote thematic reoccurrences that would indicate success or failure where public child welfare and ICT intersect.

Limitations

There were limitations to this study. This systematic literature review was conducted by a single researcher which increased the likelihood for presentation of bias in the selection of studies included in the systematic literature review. Studies that may have met inclusion criteria, but there was insufficient evidence in the abstract to confirm inclusion criteria were then reviewed in their entirety to determine if inclusion criteria was met. The probability of bias is more likely with one investigator versus multiple investigators.

Another limitation of the study is that inclusion criteria for this systematic review included only empirical, peer reviewed, published studies that were available in English. These criterion excluded data such as public child welfare agency reports, unpublished data and studies that are not published in English.

Recommendations

Social work has a historical reluctance to the adoption of ICT into practice. This systematic literature review sought to identify thematic trends of successful use, purpose, and implementation of ICT in public child welfare. The only identified
thematic reoccurrence of successful use, purpose and implementation of ICT was that ICT, regardless of type, use, purpose or implementation was that there were more occurrences of success when the end user has increased feedback, input and decision making power in the development and use of the ICT in question. In order to accurately identify themes related to successful use, purpose and implementation of ICT in public child welfare further research is necessary. Qualitative and quantitative research regarding implementation of ICT in public child welfare is also recommended.

Conclusion

The increased use of ICT in public child welfare is inevitable. Although costs of ICT appear to be falling with further gains in these areas, the cost and benefit of ICT in public child welfare is only as advantageous as the value perceived by the end user of the ICT in questions. Success of use, purpose and implementation of ICT is highly dependent on the input, feedback and collaboration in creation, determination of use, purpose and implementation strategy with the end user. Only with the end user, fully understanding and supportive of the use, purpose and implementation of the ICT will public child welfare see favorable returns on the investment of ICT.
APPENDIX A

TABLE OF INCLUDED STUDIES
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>purpose</th>
<th>sample</th>
<th>ICT discussed</th>
<th>ICT purpose</th>
<th>ICT use</th>
<th>implementation plan</th>
<th>success/failure</th>
<th>key findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aarons, G., Hurlburt, M., &amp; Horwitz, S. M. (2011). Advancing a conceptual model of evidence-based practice implementation in public service sectors. Administration Policy in Mental Health, 4-23.</td>
<td>study of implementation science, features in the model likely to be important in each phase of implementation</td>
<td>review of data/literature</td>
<td>technology based evidence based practices and interventions using various digital technology</td>
<td>this article discusses how to successful implement technology</td>
<td>undetermined</td>
<td>Four phases of implementation 1. Exploration 2. Adoption decision and preparation 3. Active implementati on, 4. sustainment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breyette, S. K. and Hill, K. (2015) The impact of electronic communication and social media on child welfare practice. Journal of Technology in Human Services</td>
<td>283-303</td>
<td>discuss impact of electronic communication and social media on child welfare practice</td>
<td></td>
<td>review of data/literature</td>
<td>electronic communication and social media</td>
<td>professional use of digital communication</td>
<td>undetermined</td>
<td>use of social media in child welfare calls for ongoing training and discussion, suggestions include development of a social media policy that matches agency organizational values and goals and addresses benefits and risks of use</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- examine professional values and identities to organizational and bureaucratic accountabilities
- qualitative
- social workers in several Australian agencies
- Department of Community Services Helpline and service delivery reforms work stress and turnover
- various office technologies, databases
- gather information, streamline information
- undetermined

practice concerns with confidentiality, development of new ICT changes professional expectations and accountability, administrators not social workers have ben influential in designing tech, strong worker and manager relationships important to successful implementation and integration of ICT adoption of ICT fueled by turnover and staff shortages, technology refocuses accountabilities to managers vs clients, technology can decrease worker stress, professional notions of accountability subverted by bureaucratic accountability

- determine risk/benefit of microcomputers were introduced into a child protection agency to improve productivity and work environment
- qualitative
- social workers
- office based technology
- ‘time tracker’ employee time sheet program
- alleviate stress
- reduce worker administrative workload
- multipurpose data systems and data entry systems
- success

hidden cost of hardware or software is education and support, the process of change is at least as important as the hardware and software purchased however when carefully implemented can provide labor and management with a better way to work
| Chan, C and Holosko, M. (2016) A review of information and communication technology enhances social work interventions. Research on Social Work Practice 26(1) 88-100. | quantitative | specific articles in journals classified under social work research area in the social science citation index | social work interventions using audiovisual broadcast systems, telephones, computer networks etc. | not applicable | studied social work interventions, some of which in child welfare, use of ICT social work interventions rated good or fair and ICT can assist in standardization and control of intervention |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of technological infrastructure at DCFS offices impacted case workers ability to use the Needs Portal. Participants reported not having internet access or computers, difficult to balance workplace demands with learning another system. &quot;don’t have time to learn new technology&quot; when users are active participants implementation and refinement the tech is more likely to be successful</td>
<td>determine accessibility etc. of Department of Children and Family Services Needs Portal internet based intervention to improve timing and quality of social service referrals in LA County</td>
<td>review of data/literature</td>
<td>success</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Internet based referral service accessible to workers and clients improve timing and quality of social service referrals in LA County

Convenience sample of DCFS caseworkers and service providers

Lack of technological infrastructure at DCFS offices impacted case workers ability to use the Needs Portal. Participants reported not having internet access or computers, difficult to balance workplace demands with learning another system. "don’t have time to learn new technology" when users are active participants implementation and refinement the tech is more likely to be successful.
| Duncan, D., Kum, H., Weigensberg, E., Flair, K., and Stewart, C. (2008). Informing child welfare policy and practice using knowledge discovery and data mining technology via a dynamic web site. Child Maltreatment (13)4 383-391 | use of knowledge discovery and data mining to create longitudinal data files from administrative data sources | qualitative | knowledge discovery and data mining web based program | workers must enter administrative data sets, data sets are then extrapolated using KDD site | KDD is ongoing process, due to policy changes data collected may evolve over time, data mining to project longitudinal data takes time and information must be entered and collected. Longitudinal data has potential to and been used for research |
| Finn, J., Kerman, B. (2004) The use of online social support by foster families. Journal of Family Social Work 8(4) | identify the extent to which foster families utilize social support on the internet | qualitative | 34 foster families in digital divide intervention program and comparison sample of 30 foster families who were not part of the program | online support groups | provide support for foster families | foster families using online support groups for support and information | success however usage low | child welfare professionals need to educate/inform foster parents and youth about these opportunities/issues create policies and practices and establish and infrastructure that promotes privacy and access |
| Foster, K., Stiffman, A. (2010) Child welfare workers' adoption of decision support technology. Journal of Technology and Human Services 27(2). 106-126 | determine how child welfare workers adopt and use decision support technology | quantitative and qualitative | child welfare workers and data collected from state child welfare workers | decision support technology | assist child welfare workers to find service providers for families with a searchable database | handheld and desktop | child welfare workers develop specific assessment and referral patterns that become embedded and these patterns are difficult to change particularly when asked to conceptualize a central job function | supported but not adopted |

- Discussion on social work perspectives and concerns on use of mass databases to gather/store data on individuals and repercussions.
- Review of data/literature on government mass databases.
- Identify children who may be at risk/in need of additional services.
- Enter information in mass database.
- Failure of mass databases may be of major concern to civil liberties of children and families.

- Social work is increasingly being ordered, devised and structured by academics, policy makers and e-technicians who are far removed from day-to-day practice.
- A dual strategy is needed to respond constructively.
- Dual strategy would be: 1) Constructive collaboration with those involved in ICT deployment; 2) Confrontation of ICT deployment and resistance to ICT deployment.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gillingham, P. (2011). Computer-based information systems and human service organization s: emerging problems and future possibilities. Australian Social Work 64(3) 299-312.</th>
<th>discuss consequences and concerns with the use of mass databases</th>
<th>review of data/literature</th>
<th>integrated children system</th>
<th>identify children who may be at risk/ in need of additional services</th>
<th>identify children at risk or in need of services</th>
<th>failure</th>
<th>concerns with confidentiality, ethical values, shift away from individual/parental responsibility to government responsibility for children, costly increases work load in terms of administrative tasks and impedes service delivery</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hall, C., Parton, N., Peckover, S., White, S. (2010) Child-centric information and communication technology (ICT) and the fragmentation of child welfare practice in England. Journal of Social Policy 39(3) 393-413</td>
<td>discussion on ICT and the fragmentation of information and knowledge on mass bureaucratic databases</td>
<td>qualitative</td>
<td>integrated children’s system/mass databases/looking after children database/common assessment framework</td>
<td>identify at risk children, gather data, referrals for service</td>
<td>to create assessment tools/fill in docs for referrals for services for children identified at need</td>
<td>failure</td>
<td>electronic case records and forms, too long to be read/understood by parents, fragmentation of data, questionable consent, systems need to be designed, current systems lack user centered design and human computer interaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ince, D. and Griffiths, A. (2011)</td>
<td>A chronicling system for children's social work: learning from the ICS failure.</td>
<td>British Journal of Social Work 41, 1497-1513</td>
<td>Discussion on why ICS failed, consequences of mass egovernment databases</td>
<td>Review of data/literature</td>
<td>Integrated children's system (mass egovernment database)</td>
<td>Record keeping and reporting functions</td>
<td>Reorganize child welfare in the UK, provide a standard set of processes, standard set of computer programs that support the processes and a common database that holds this data, provide a framework that enabled interchange of information between relevant agencies involved with the interaction with a child in need</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

determine if iPhones, handheld technology, video calls reduce face to face visits with SafeCare intervention

| Qualitative and quantitative | 9 families in metro Atlanta, 4 declined and 4 agreed that had one child 5 or younger | handheld technology with video call capability | reduce face to face visits to ensure safety of the child for homes with hazards that met child abuse/neglect standards in the process of creating child safety, reduce ‘home checks’ to complete home checks for safety hazards | when the module was enhanced by iPhone there were substantial reductions in household hazards in all rooms across all participants including a 1 month follow up, iPhone was used as intervention and data collection tool, face to face time reduced in current study, enhanced communication between visits and made logistics of intervention easier. Use of technology in reducing attrition and increasing compliance shows potential. Although promising depend on availability of handheld devices with high quality video and wireless connectivity | success |

study on technology mediated initiatives and how caseworkers perceive these initiatives in regards to knowledge management

2ndary data analysis using data from 2008 Survey of Organizational Excellence

gather administrative data and assist in decision making

gather information and record information to assist in case management decisions

ICT failure to fulfill its intended purposes to information based and technology driven interventions, there is fragmentatio n of knowledge and little generation of useful knowledge vs information, recommende d that administrator s and researchers shift their perspective to knowledge based and sociotechnica l and understand the effect of ICT on knowledge

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discussion</th>
<th>Review of data/literature</th>
<th>Data systems/information systems/data bases</th>
<th>To create child wellbeing indicators in administrative data that is already being collected</th>
<th>Undetermined</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>current systems focus on negative outcomes, this limits ability to use system data to track child wellbeing, may be possible to integrate more subjective measures of wellbeing into case records to examine real time evidence of functioning to better inform ability to support a child’s capacity.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>describes the need for and practicality and utility of longitudinal multisector and multilevel administrative data to address key issues in child maltreatment prevention and intervention</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>review of data/literature</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multi-sector databases, data storage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for large linked databases to store data for longitudinal studies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>use for study and creation of data to create evidence based policy and advance child welfare policy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>undetermined</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SW is moving toward default expectation of instantaneous access to information</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kepple, N., Freisthler, B., Johnson-Motoyama, M. (2014) Bias in child maltreatment self reports using interactive voice response (IVR). Child Abuse and Neglect 38 1694-1705</td>
<td>addresses the utility of interactive voice response for child maltreatment behaviors by assessing differences between respondents who completed and did not complete a survey using IVR technology</td>
<td>general population survey of 3,023 parents of legal guardians with children 12 years or younger residing in 50 cities in California</td>
<td>assess utility of IVR methods with parent self report of child maltreatment behavior</td>
<td>advance understanding of scope of abuse and neglect experienced by children especially for populations overlooked by current surveillance systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kum, H., Stewart, C., Rose, R., Duncan, D. (2015)</td>
<td>Using big data for evidence based governance in child welfare. Children and Youth Services Review 58 127-136</td>
<td>discussion on importance of improving governance of child welfare system and take administrative data and transforming it into knowledge for policy and management actions through information generation process</td>
<td>qualitative and quantitative</td>
<td>north Carolina child welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loree, A., Beliciu, D., Ondersma, S. (2014) KinCareTech: interactive, internet-based software to support kinship caregivers</td>
<td>determine effectiveness, usefulness for KinCareTech internet based program</td>
<td>qualitative and quantitative</td>
<td>members of a support group based in Detroit, Michigan for grandparent[s raising grandchildre[n</td>
<td>internet support groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mucro, E. (2007). The dangers of information sharing. Social Policy Journal of New Zealand. 31</td>
<td>critique of the policy being implemented in England with particular focus on the role given to professionals collecting and sharing information about families as a means of screening children and deciding which ones to target</td>
<td>review of data/literature</td>
<td>gather data, assess and determine which children require further intervention or services</td>
<td>professionals, social workers, children’s services, education services, health services, clients and mental health providers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposal of subspecialty in child welfare in informatics</td>
<td>Review of data/literature data collection, analysis and information and communication technology to create knowledge, and analyze longitudinal data</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development of universal communications medium and study of design, application and use of information technology in disciplines</td>
<td>undetermined</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CWI would integrate child welfare, computer science and information science to manage and communicate the data, information and knowledge that child welfare collects already however the child welfare workforce often has inadequate computer skill, lack of motivation of users of the technology and hardware and network barriers.
| Nguyen, L. (2007) Child welfare informatics: a new definition for an established practice. Social Work 52(4)361-363 | proposal on child welfare informatics | review of data/literature | data collection, analysis and information and communication technology to create knowledge, and analyze longitudinal data | create information and knowledge more readily available to better understand how to improve | undetermined | CWI would identify and analyze the data needed to develop more effective tools for practice, assist in modifying policy and best practice but there are few analysts equipped to do this |

| Analysis of parents using video assisted technology to visit with child during family reunification | Qualitative | 40 Social Workers | Video assisted technology for parents to visit with their children during family reunification process | Increase frequency of visits using VAV during reunification process | VAV was implemented as an experimental procedure to identify benefits or concerns with using it as a means of visitation during reunification | Undetermined | Concerns noted where young children who were unable to benefit from pure video assisted visitation and required more interaction, concern with monitoring and supervising visits, concern parents would believe that VAV could replace face to face visits |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Florida's department of health established telemedicine project to facilitate immediate expert medical evaluation of alleged child abuse or neglect, baseline examination of the project | telehealth technology including video calls, transport facilities, dedicated lines, integrated services digital networks, wireless technologies | allow for immediate medical evaluation of alleged child abuse | child protection staff and medical staff to use to evaluate child abuse/neglect | implemented in multiple stages | unsuccessful |
| technology use was affected by unforeseen variables such as physical space limitations and examination room availability, concerns about privacy issues were rare however consumer friendly equipment is necessary, staff engagement early in the process will result in greater likelihood of use of said technology |
| Parton, N. (2009). Challenges to practice and knowledge in child welfare social work: from the 'social' to the 'informational'? Children and Youth Services Review 31 p 715-721 | discussion on the possible impact of new information and communication technology systems and reflects on the shift from the narrative to a database ways of thinking and operating | review of data/literature | databases | identify at risk children, gather data, referrals for service | to record and create referrals for service for at risk children who may need further intervention or services | concern that majority of child welfare workers report that new technology systems increase administrative work and decrease time available for direct practice, "database expression" vs "narrative expression" becoming more prevalent and an increase focus on surface information and the holistic view is lost. Databases created to increase managerialism and accountability |

critical analysis of the changes and argues that there is a significant shift in responsibilities and relationships between children, parents, professionals and the state due to mass e governance databases

review of data/literature

Common Assessment Framework, Integrated Children's Services data bases

identify at risk children, gather data, referrals for service

to record and create referrals for service for at risk children who may need further intervention or services

challenges arising from rationale, organization and focus of needs due to growing reliance on new systems of screening and surveillance, increase in managerialism control, reliance on ICT reduced discretion of the practitioner
| Peckover, S., and Hall, C. From policy to practice the implementation and negotiation of technologies in everyday child welfare. Children and Society 23pp 136-148 |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| review of findings regarding introduction of children's database and Common Assessment Framework in the UK |
| review of data/literature |
| children's database, Common Assessment Framework |
| identify at risk children, gather data, referrals for service |
| to record and create referrals for service for at risk children who may need further intervention or services |
| national policy did not take into consideration local contextual interpretation, implementation not planned well due to mass enforcement and implementation failure |
| concerns regarding trends to e-government, differences in translation and implementation of national policy to local contacts, prisoners faced difficulties deciding how and when to use ICT |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| critical analysis of the proposal for using information and communication technology in egovernance |
| review of data/literature, qualitative and quantitative |
| interviews, focus groups, non-participant observation of meetings, training sessions and professional |
| Common Assessment Framework, Integrated Children's Services data bases |
| identify at risk children, gather data, referrals for service |
| to record and create referrals for service for at risk children who may need further intervention or services |
| functionality dependent upon being used, difficulties with security features, malfunctions in searches when it is unable to accurately identify a child's e-record, ethnographic engagement with the population of professionals intended to use the program so design can be user centered and complexities and priorities of day to day job understood in the design |

| Critical analysis of information technology in children's services | Review of data/literature | Integrated children's system (massin government database) | Failure to record and create referrals for service for at risk children who may need further intervention or services | Identify children who may need further intervention and create referrals for services | ICS inadequately engages and assess risk in daily practice, the databases are invasive and the temporal restrictions and dimensions of the E-Systems are difficult to manage with increasing workload and time constraints create difficulties in engaging with clients |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th align="left">View of child welfare professionals as having both the skills and the resources of an electronic office</th>
<th align="left">Common Assessment Framework database</th>
<th align="left">Critical analysis of the Common Assessment Framework data base</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td align="left">Referred referrals for services for at-risk children who may need further intervention or services</td>
<td align="left">To record and create referrals for services for at-risk children who may need further intervention or services</td>
<td align="left">Review of data/literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td align="left">Identify children who may need further intervention and create referrals for services</td>
<td align="left">Recommend hybrid versions</td>
<td align="left">Professional discretion, SW must manage unpredictable events when ICT fails to work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td align="left">Preston, M. (2015). Case manager job strain in public child welfare agencies: job demands and job controls additive effects and instrumental feedbacks mediating role</td>
<td align="left">analyze perceived job strain and control in public child welfare</td>
<td align="left">quantitative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td align="left">Sage, M. (2014) Use of web 2.0 to train facilitators in fidelity: a case study</td>
<td align="left">use of computer training and blog and technology fidelity tools to see if these improved model fidelity to family group decision making</td>
<td align="left">qualitative and quantitative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td align="left">--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td align="left"></td>
<td align="left"></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td align="left">discussion/analysis of social media use in child welfare</td>
<td align="left"></td>
<td align="left"></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td align="left">review of data/literature</td>
<td align="left"></td>
<td align="left"></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td align="left">social media</td>
<td align="left"></td>
<td align="left"></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td align="left">social media can create cost effective opportunities for support interventions, maintain contact with clients and stakeholders, assist in public outreach, improvement for government transparency and aid in assessment of child safety</td>
<td align="left"></td>
<td align="left"></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td align="left">use of social media calls for ongoing training and discussion, employers and employees will likely benefit if policy and practice are created with ethics and agency goals in mind, possible to expand types and sources of information available to child welfare workers.</td>
<td align="left"></td>
<td align="left"></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td align="left">Scannapieco, M., and Iannone, M. (2014)</td>
<td align="left">Native American Indian child welfare system change: virtual implementation of a data system based on practice models</td>
<td align="left">qualitative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td align="left">go live for the working system</td>
<td align="left"></td>
<td align="left"></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td align="left">Sen, R. (2010) Managing contact in Scotland for children in non-permanent out of home placement. Child Abuse Review 19 423-437</td>
<td align="left">research on social workers views and experiences of managing contact for children in public care</td>
<td align="left">qualitative</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

critical analysis of the Integrated Children's System and consequences of this technology  
review of literature/data, qualitative  

e-governance database, Integrated Children's Services  

to record and create referrals for service for at risk children who may need further intervention or services  
identify and create referrals of at risk children, monitor children at risk, and gather administrative data  

ICS is difficult to use and difficult to see the entire story, uses database language vs narrative language and professionals must decide what is important or serious and the is concern for data integrity, certain spaces have limited characters, and there is a shift in language for, further it pushes SW into a performance culture, distances the service user but does allow focus and clarity. there is a depersonalization and lower morale, don't feel professional and loss or professional autonomy and increase in routines.
| Shaw, I., Morris, K., Edwards, A. (2009) Technology, social services and organization innovation or how great expectation in London and Cardiff are dashed in Lowestoft and Cymytrch. Journal of Social Work Practice 23(4): 383-400 | critical analysis of policy implementation of the Integrated Children's System and the Children's Fund | ICS: four pilot authorities, focus groups, survey of team leaders, interviews with social workers children, families, Children's Fund: three evaluations on large scale data sets and secondary data analysis | to identify at risk children, record documentation, identify early stage children at risk of social exclusion and make sure receive help and support needed | documentation, assist with services | intentions of the programs were not realized, insufficient IT expertise and staff to support social work staff, early stages of implementation were preoccupied with gaining technical knowledge and learning rules regarding policy, service users had little knowledge of the policy or systems, management requirement in introducing substantial technology/policy innovations are the same as introducing any large project, likely to be difficult to distinguish problems that are associated with implementation period and those that are endemic, policy innovations that involve organizations where knowledge workers are the agents of service delivery are likely to raise substantial and relatively enduring challenges, personal experience in context |
| Touche-Manley, L., Dietzen, L., Nankin, J., Beigel, A. (2013) Revolutionizing child welfare with outcomes management. Journal of Behavioral Health Services and Research p317-329 | analysis of outcomes management technology and barriers to it | review of literature/data, quantitative | youth ages 10-19 who were receiving services through child welfare systems due to abuse or neglect | use of clinical data and administrative data collected in databases to create outcome management data | use data as a means to translate research into practice | data collected and analyzed through tool by researchers | undetermined | necessary to change organizationa l culture to accept measurement as a valuable tool to the care that they need, create a predictive model of resilience that can be translated into effective case management reports, allows social workers to see real time results |
| Tregeagle, S. (2016) | Heads in the cloud: an example of practice-based information and communication technology in child welfare. Journal of Technology in Human Services 34(2) 224-239 | development of ICT by a nongovernmental child welfare agency | qualitative | nongovernmental child welfare agency | development of ICT | standardized guided practice system | practice led, practice development center established in the agency, this completed staff training integrating the system into the professional and administrative life of the agency and improved the usability of the guided practice system, SW staff ran this in partnet | technology must be shaped by input of uses, interest will continue, communication between developers and social workers is necessary and critical long term process and uses extensive resources | successful |
relationship with ICT developers and support
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tregeagle, S., Darcy, M.</td>
<td>Child welfare and information and communication technology: today's challenge. British Journal of Social Work 38 p1481-1498</td>
<td>Use of information and communication technology such as data bases, computers and the internet. documentation, data collection etc. outcomes management, efficiency, accountability.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Critical analysis on critical analysis on critical analysis on outcomes management technology in regards to massive databases. Review of literature/data, qualitative analysis on social work processes, children’s social workers, integration of children’s services, common assessment framework, outcome management technologies. Identify at risk children, gather data, and referrals for service. Identify and create work arounds and ‘faux’ compliance. Increase in administrative tasks in child protection and the creation of databases holding incorrect information, and the pressure when engaging families and attempting to safeguard child's welfare.

critical analysis of electronic records and work spaces qualitative human service, social service and child protection staff in the UK

Integrated Children's Services and the Common Assessment Framework mass egovernance data bases identify at risk children, gather data, referrals for service

identify and create referrals for at risk children, monitor children at risk, and gather administrative state

failure
design is difficult to use, users cited tangible components of case files as necessary, design needs to come from users vs. IT, computer display has limitations and the importance of professional sense-making is lost
| Zonfrillo, M., Kumar, M., Fortes, J., and Winston, F. (2012) Telecenter for secure, remote, collaborative child fatality review. Injury Prevention 18, 399-404 | review of child fatality review data collection, use of telecenter, web based appliance for remote/secure collaborative review | qualitative | child fatality team leaders | remote/secure web based telecenter | assist in interviews/collaborate regarding child fatality reviews | allow for improvement of efficiency of reviews and access to participants using this technology | Pilot testing and implementation of an adapted telecenter, the pilot designed for suburban CFR and implemented immediately to review how it would work with team leaders and designed with the end user in mind | success | telecenter can overcome most challenges with use friendly multi user tools and that only basic training is necessary |
| White, S., Wastell, D., Broadhurst, K., and Hall, C. (2010) When policy o'erleaps itself; the 'tragic tale' of the Integrated Children's System. Critical Social Policy 30(3) 405-429 | findings from 2 year ethnographic study on the impact and origin of the Integrated Children's System | quantitative and qualitative | child protection workers, managers and families in the UK | Integrated Children's Services egovernance data base | created to streamline information, gather information, documentation etc., create accountability and better system | document case work, create timelines, accountability and common practice model | implemented in mass scale due to government policy failure | format does not encourage good communication, necessary data gathering is time consuming, timescales that do not factor in human interaction, suggestions that principles of design these tools calls for ethnographic study |
| Morgan, A., and Fraser, F. (2010) Looked after young people and their social work managers: a study of contrasting experiences of using computer assisted self interviewing. The British Journal of Social Work 40(2) 445-461 | study of contrasting experience of social workers and children/young people when using audio computer self interviewing | quantitative | foster youth using audio computer assisted self interviewing and case managers | audio computer assisted self interviewing | used for foster youth to participate in their individual care planning | foster youth answer questions about their wellbeing by a computer using audio computer assisted self interviewing | success | children and youth believed that A-CASI is useful, relatively risk free and efficient to register their opinions regarding their own wellbeing, case managers reported usage had diminished and is was being used principally for youth to record their views in statutory reviews of their care, concerned that data collected is patchy and not sufficiently supported organizationally and requests made via A-CASI not followed up on |
|---|---|
| Study of effects/success of video feedback coaching for parents visiting with children in the child welfare system | Quantitative |
| Four mother child dyads | Video feedback technology |
| For parents to receive coaching while/after visitation with their child(ren) to facilitate healthy visitation and reunification | Used during visits and coaching session for feedback on how visits, how to improve, direct client service to facilitate reunification and safety |
| Undetermined | FIND intervention resulted in systematic increases in the four targeted parenting behaviors and they were maintained for one week post intervention, possible positive uses, further research necessary |

g protection in children’s services in England. Children and Youth Services Review 28, 976-992

critical analysis of the changes in policy to the integrated children’s services, common assessment regarding mass
egovernance databases and surveillance review of literature/data
egovernance mass data bases such as integrated children’s services and Common Assessment Framework
document , create common child protection practice model, identify at risk children and create referrals for service across disciplines used by social service professionals to assess and create referrals for children in need of services, mass egovernance data base capturing information and creation of common practice model danger in risk factors included in the technical analysis are broad and ill-defined concept of what is a cause for concern’, concerns with privacy and the shift of responsibility away from parents onto the state for children

The study regarding effectiveness of ICS and families with disabled children did not meet standardized examples and do not follow normative patterns. Qualitative and quantitative social workers and families experienced assessment reviews under ICS with disabled children. Integrated children’s services and governance database were provided a single approach to assessment and create comprehensive reviews for children in need of electronic services. Mass implementation was new and there was insufficient information provided on how to access and retrieve state. Failure was reported on the four pilot authorities. Training was provided on technical problems in reducing time, gaining efficiency, and sharing among different groups of practitioners. Leadership and planning were limited due to early implementation and due to problems already experienced. Possibilities in reducing time, gaining efficiency, and sharing among different groups of practitioners were limited due to early implementation and due to problems already experienced. Possibilities in reducing time, gaining efficiency, and sharing among different groups of practitioners were limited due to early implementation and due to problems already experienced.
| Holmes, L., McDermid, S. Jones, A., and Ward, H. (2009) How social workers spend their time: an analysis of the key issues that impact on practice pre-and post implementation of the Integrated Children's System. | comparison of data collected from two series of focus groups to identify what social workers spend their time on and address concerns with an increasing administrative burden is deflecting social workers working directly with families. | focus groups of social workers from 6 different authorities in England | single approach to assessment/review, ideally providing a more coherent comprehensive and efficient system of electronic information and record keeping and sharing among different groups of practitioners. | used by social service professionals to assess and create referrals for children in need of services, mass egovernance data base capturing information and creation of common practice model. | failure | concerns with time spent on indirect activities compared with direct activities, workers consistently reported that the time they spent on administrative and indirect work was between 80-90 percent, difficulties associated with implementati on of ICS and electronic systems in general and the environment of continued change made it difficult. |
| Dodsworth, J. Bailey, S. Schofield, G., Cooper, N., Fleming, P., and Young, J. (2013) Internet technology: an empowering or alienating tool for communication between foster carers and social workers? British Journal of Social Work 43, 775-795 | reports on the introduction in English fostering services a purpose designed internet service which aims to improve information flow to foster carers, enhance interaction and information exchange between foster carers and social workers and provide a social networking facility for communication between carers within a secure environment | qualitative and quantitative | foster parents in England | internet based forum, communication and networking for foster parents to facilitate easier and improved communication | purpose designed internet based service for communication and networking for foster parents to facilitate easier flow of information to foster parents, create connections between foster parents | in some district computers were supplied to the foster families, in rural areas this did not happen | partial success | The internet service had potential to improve services and communication but improvements to the website, ongoing administrative support and training for all professionals involved are necessary. Technology can appear impersonal and alienating to some and there is a need for a range of communication methods. |
|---|
| large scale egovernance databases, common assessment framework, integrated children's services |
| critical analysis of literature and data |
| integrated children's services egovernance database |
| single approach to assessment/review, ideally provide a more coherent comprehensive and efficient system of electronic information and record keeping and sharing among different groups of practitioners |
| used by social service professionals to assess and create referrals for children in need of services, mass egovernance database capturing information and creation of common practice model |
| piecemeal implementati on of large systems and documenting all children on all databases violates ethics and privacy and holds further concern for parental responsibility vs. state assuming responsibility |
| failure |
| Nygren, L., Hyvon, U. Khoo, E. (2009) The traveling idea of looking after children: conditions for moulding a systematic approach in child welfare in three national contexts - Australia, Canada and Sweden | Looking After Children approach and standardized assessment tools | qualitative | caseworkers and managers in child welfare in Canada, Sweden and Australia | Looking After Children which is an assessment, case planning and review system and designed to promote positive development in foster children | to assess, document and standardized child welfare practice | child welfare staff to develop/document and assess foster children | fundamental ideology successful, however it is stressed that there is no universal system as cultural contexts and linguistics and the end use must be taken into consideration | successful in principle |
| Munro, E (2005) What tools do we need to improve identification of child abuse. Child Abuse Review 14. 374-388. | assessment tools | critical analysis of literature and data | standardized assessment tools, large governmental data bases | assist in assessment and decision making | | | Concern with a 'tool' approach versus a 'user centered' approach. ICT cost usually not projected correctly. ICT systems are only as good as data entered into it. | undetermined |
| Gillingham, P., and Humphreys, C. (2010) | Child protection practitioners and decision making tools: observations from the front line. | Structured Decision Making | qualitative | Assist in standardization of safety and risk decisions and create consistency and target the children in the most need | Use in child welfare professionals decision making | Partial success | Overestimation of risk, restricted practice, oversimplification, shift in focus (administrative task), accountability undermined in the development of expertise |
|—— | ———— | ———— | ———— | ———— | ———— | ———— | ———— |
| Lechuize, I., Penders, F., Horstman, K. (2013) | Constructing infrastructures, constructing children and professionals' ‘at risk’: ICT implementation in Dutch child welfare | ICT infrastructure, the Child Index | critical analysis of literature and data | Determine at risk children, and improve early detection and improve professional collaboration | | Undetermined | Implementation of the child index causes concern for privacy and confidentiality as well as cost and labor in creating and managing such an infrastructure.
Webster, D., Needell, B., Wildfire, J. (2002) *Data are your friends: child welfare agency self-evaluation in Los Angeles County with the Family to Family Initiative. Children and youth services review* 24(67) 471-484

<p>| desktop mapping | qualitative and quantitative | geographical information | mapping to identify data on areas of higher concern, foster youth population, create community based resources | use of teams and task forces as well as pilot programs to get the system running quickly | success | reform for child welfare self-evaluation, overcoming initial resistance and pilot programs |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Findings/Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kaonga, N., Batavia, H., Philbrisk, W., Mechael, P.</td>
<td>Information and communication technology for child protection case management in emergencies: an overview of the existing evidence base.</td>
<td>Humanitarian Technology: Science, Systems and Global Impact 2016</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>key informant interviews, literature review for child protection + ICT, child protection + mobile technology, Child protection + information management</td>
<td>examine possibilities for timely, quality data and information during global emergencies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ICT, data recording, electronic client data and case records qualitative, literature review, case study approach case Study of Charlotte system in Flanders electronic case management electronic client records accountability undetermined

SW try at street level to preserve the narrative of social work versus the data base integration, high workload makes it difficult to use, work arounds, is this public accountability versus client registration, loss of professional discretion, systems not deemed essential for optimal care
REFERENCES


Bowen, R. (2014). Mobility is changing the face of social work. *Policy & Practice, 8*(10), 38.


